# **UCLA**

# Carte Italiane

## **Title**

"Cien años de participación:" Magical Realism and Italian History in Antonio Tabucchi's *Piazza d'Italia* 

## **Permalink**

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3xn8062f

# **Journal**

Carte Italiane, 2(5)

## **ISSN**

0737-9412

## **Author**

Hanna, Monica

# **Publication Date**

2009

#### DOI

10.5070/C925011380

Peer reviewed

# "Cien años de participación:" Magical Realism and Italian History in Antonio Tabucchi's *Piazza d'Italia*

Monica Hanna CUNY Graduate Center

> Cosa vuoi che me ne importi dell'Italia, con questo ghiaccio. Ho chiesto ai compagni se a loro gliene importa e tutti la pensano come me. Il capitano mi ha diffidato di sovversione.<sup>1</sup>

In Antonio Tabucchi's 1975 novel Piazza d'Italia. Favola popolare in tre tempi, un epilogo e un'appendice,2 the main character fights for Italy during World War I. In a letter to his beloved, he describes the harsh physical conditions he suffers in the trenches. "Cosa vuoi che me ne importi dell'Italia, con questo ghiaccio," he asks, explaining that his fellow soldiers feel the same way. This questioning of the power of nationalism is typical in the novel. Piazza d'Italia surveys important moments of Italian national history as experienced by a family of rebels who often oppose the forces of the nation in their fictional Tuscan town of Borgo. Tabucchi's novel begins with an epilogue and travels backward and forward in time in order to relate one hundred years of Italian history, from the Risorgimento through the two world wars to the establishment of the Italian republic, compressed into a narrative of one hundred fifty pages. The family and their friends are skeptical of the representation of national history as one of progress, instead noting the many negative reverberations of that national history in the lives of the protagonists of the novel. The narrative structure of the text mirrors this skepticism, veering away from a traditional representation of historical progress to one of fragmentation, repetition, and shifts in time.

Tabucchi employs a variety of methods to re-structure historical representation. One prominent structural method employed by the novel is that of magical realism, which allows for the representation of a cyclical, rather than linear or progressive, history. The text also draws on

microhistorical methods as translated to literature in order to fill in some of the gaps of official historical narratives. By adopting these narrative and historiographic methods, Antonio Tabucchi's first novel presents a resistance history of the Italian nation. *Piazza d'Italia* restructures history, providing alternative visions of the effects of historical "progress" and different methods of representing history; it recasts history, focusing the narrative on the lives of rebellious characters that would not normally be considered important historical figures; and it re-stages history, emphasizing alternative spaces in this reconstruction of national history.

#### RESTRUCTURING HISTORY: MAGICAL REALISM IN PIAZZA D'ITALIA

In the 1990s, a Spanish interviewer noted the similarities between Tabucchi's first novel and Gabriel García Márquez's work, stating "En estas primeras novelas se aprecia un cierto influjo de García Márquez. Ambas son sagas familiares cuyos protagonistas comparten, además de los mismos nombres, la vocación de rebeldes y un destino atroz." Antonio Tabucchi responded "Sí, quizá, pero se trata en todo caso de un mero influjo superficial, porque en realidad los de García Márquez son cien años de soledad, mientras que yo hablo de cien años de participación." Despite this dismissal of García Márquez's *Cien años de soledad* as only a superficial influence (and a work that is less politically engaged), magical realism constitutes an important element of Tabucchi's representation of a resistance history of the Italian nation. Magical realism influences *Piazza d'Italia*'s narrative structure as well as its representations of characters, space, historical movement, and reality.

Tabucchi's response to the interviewer's question belies one of the structural confluences of *Piazza d'Italia* and *Cien años de soledad*. Both novels present a one hundred year period of history in the lives of a family in a fictional town. They tell stories with predetermined endings, whose narratives begin at the chronological end of the accounts related. Their stories also share explicit and implicit questionings of historiographic methods by altering the representation of historical progress, indeed questioning the very notion of progress, as reflected in the narrative structure of the novels. Both emphasize the cyclical and repetitive nature of historical time, thereby deconstructing official national historical narratives of linear progress. At the same time as Tabucchi uses some of the structural elements of García Márquez's novel, he also expands on the sources of his magical realism by drawing on traditions particular to the Italian context.

Though magical realism is a notoriously difficult term to define, Wendy Faris describes five basic characteristics of magical realist fiction in *Ordinary Enchantments*, her book on magical realism in world literature:

First, the text contains an 'irreducible element' of magic; second, the descriptions in magical realism detail a strong presence of the phenomenal world; third, the reader may experience some unsettling doubts in the effort to reconcile two contradictory understandings of events; fourth, the narrative merges different realms; and, finally, magical realism disturbs received ideas about time, space, and identity.<sup>5</sup>

This definition is useful in discussing Tabucchi's novel and the ways in which it adopts magical realism. The most conspicuous way in which Piazza d'Italia fits Faris's definition is in its challenge to "received ideas about time, space, and identity." Temporal movement in the novel can often be disorienting for the reader because of the novel's structure and the names of the characters. The novel begins with the ostensible chronological end of the story of Garibaldo's family in the epilogue. The "Primo Tempo" begins with a very short chapter that flashes back to the death of Garibaldo's father (the first Garibaldo). The second chapter constitutes another flashback as it presents the story of Plinio, the first Garibaldo's father and the second Garibaldo's grandfather. The narrative then proceeds forward in time, though there are various flashbacks and flash forwards. Not only is the representation of chronology upended and presented in fragments, but the characters themselves comment on the strangeness of the passage of time in Borgo. Already on the second page of the novel, the reader is alerted to this by the assertion that "nella famiglia di Garibaldo il tempo era sempre corso su fili speciali."6 The novel displays a consistent preoccupation with time and shows that the time lived by the characters in the novel often does not conform to traditional concepts of temporality, especially historical time.

There are explicit references to the subject of time throughout the text. The subtitle of the novel alludes to the question of time in its phrase "tre tempi." The "Primo Tempo" begins with a chapter called "C'era ancora un po' di tempo." Several characters explicitly reference the unusual nature of time in Borgo. In one instance, the town's priest Don Milvio reflects:

Guardando i cani randagi che si rincorrevano sul sagrato pensò che gli anni a Borgo dovevano essere di molti mesi in meno del normale. Gli pareva l'inverno passato, quando aveva inventato la macchina idraulica dell'uguaglianza e in una risorsa disperata si era affacciato alla finestra per chiamare Garibaldo. Invece erano passati quasi quarant'anni, all'uguaglianza era seguito un perfezionamento d'appendice, la giustizia, e un altro uomo era morto di violenza e sopraffazione, ammazzato a bastonate.<sup>7</sup>

Don Milvio imagines that the years in Borgo must be shorter, containing fewer months than "normal," because of the repetition of acts, which include murder as mentioned in the passage. Don Milvio's thoughts display one of the effects of the shift in temporality in *Piazza d'Italia*: the repetition of events produces a vision of cyclical history. There are many gestures that are repeated through the text such as letter writing, rock throwing, and writing in the ashes of the home's hearth. There are also repeated destinies. The men in Garibaldo's family all die at the age of thirty and have problems with their feet. They all travel in some form or other while the women all remain in Borgo. While the men are often described in stances of resistance or defiance, the women are often portrayed in stances of waiting and enduring.

Early in the novel, Esterina notices her adolescent son Volturno's propensity for responding to questions asked the day before and "remembering" things that have yet to happen. This fact does not worry her until Volturno claims to remember his twin brother Quarto's death in Africa despite the fact that Quarto has never left their small Tuscan town and is in fact still alive at this point in the novel. Esterina's concern drives her to consult Zelmira, Borgo's *strega* who is known for her horoscopes and prophecies. Zelmira declares of Volturno, "È poeta," and she diagnoses him with "il Mal del Tempo." In its immediate context, this malady refers to Volturno's confusion of time. Yet in the greater context of the novel, this "Mal del Tempo" affects many of the other characters as well as the events and narrative structure of the novel.

Tabucchi's representation of time in *Piazza d'Italia*, along with its characters' experiences of that time, have several elements in common with Gabriel García Márquez's incredibly popular and emblematic magical realist novel *Cien años de soledad.*<sup>9</sup> Many of these are clear even

in a superficial reading. For example, the openings of the two novels signal some interesting similarities. Tabucchi's novel begins with the following sentence:

Quando Garibaldo, quel giorno da chiodi, si beccò la pallottola in fronte (un forellino capocchioso, nemmeno un foruncolo), mentre stramazzava nel bacinìo della piazza, proprio davanti allo Splendor, volle avere l'ultima parola.<sup>10</sup>

García Márquez's 1967 novel, meanwhile, begins with this sentence: "Muchos años después, frente al pelotón de fusilamiento, el coronel Aureliano Buendía había de recordar aquella tarde remota en que su padre lo llevó a conocer el hielo."11 Both first sentences present the figure of a man facing a gun, though Aureliano Buendía is a colonel who does not end up being shot during the episode recounted on the first page of the novel, while Garibaldo's name is not prefaced by any title and he is shot. Nonetheless, both men face guns in public arenas— Garibaldo in the piazza in front of a line of carabinieri and Buendía in front of a firing squad. From this starting point, both novels move backward in time toward earlier periods in the histories of the families of their respective protagonists. Both novels present one hundred years in the history of a town and a family in a compressed space, though Tabucchi's novel is much more compressed than García Márquez's, with approximately one-third the number of pages and organized in extremely brief chapters. They also both relate the stories of male characters whose names repeat over the years in ways that can at times confuse the reader. The characters in both novels inherit not only their names, but also a propensity for violent deaths. Finally, both works focus on the role of prophecy and its ability to provide an alternative grasp of the histories that unfold in the texts.

The representation of history through magical realism is not merely an aesthetic element, but upends the very basis of historiography by questioning its reliance on traditional concepts of time. Amaryll Chanady, in an essay called "The Territorialization of the Imaginary in Latin America: Self-Affirmation and Resistance to Metropolitan Paradigms," examines the question of temporality in some of the most important Latin American magical realist texts. She says of Alejo Carpentier's famous magical realist novel:

Carpentier's rearrangement of the 'normal' chronology in The Kingdom of this World involves more than poetic license and structural experimentation. It challenges the dominant historiographical paradigm based on empiricism, and replaces it with one that does not correspond to what is traditionally regarded as truth, but which produces meaning in what Carpentier considers a far more effective way. It is not merely a question of fictionalizing history by adapting 'facts' to the [fictional] plot, extrapolating and supplying invented characters and situations, as is the case in most historical novels. Carpentier creates a different chronology whose structure illustrates one of the dominant themes of the novel, eternal return and the cyclical notion of time of 'primitive' mentalities. Chronological historiographical 'reality' is only one of the infinite number of truths, and maybe not even the most effective one.12

Tabucchi's project is similar in several ways to Carpentier's as outlined by Chanady. *Piazza d'Italia* rejects the notion of historical movement as linear progress. <sup>13</sup> The concept of linear progress is one that is often present in official national narratives. It is this faith in progress, for example, that might have led Benedetto Croce to claim that fascism was merely an ellipsis in Italian history; to suggest otherwise would mean that Italian national history is not one of continual progress. Instead of a history driven by a constant movement forward, *Piazza d'Italia* presents a history of returns and repetitions. Fascism is hardly an ellipsis in this account of history; instead, it is the logical consequence for a society in which there is always an imbalance of power, and the marginalized protagonists are always on the losing side. The figure of Mussolini in the novel has the same valence as the figure of the king or of democracy, as is made clear in the piazza's monument.

In her essay cited earlier, Chanady rejects the "naive essentialist argument to the supposed marvelous reality of the [American] continent or ascribed to the unidirectional flow of metropolitan influence." <sup>14</sup> Instead, she suggests that magical realism also derives from European sources, particularly surrealism, in which important Latin American magical realists like Carpentier participated in France. This is important to keep in mind for an investigation of a European magical realist text. Notable, of course, is the fact that magical realism as a term was used

in Europe by German art critic Franz Roh and Italian author Massimo Bontempelli decades before Carpentier discussed the idea of the "real marravilloso americano" in Latin America. Chanady's interpretation of the genre shifts attention away from regional specificity, toward larger questions of narrative and historiographic representation. Wendy Faris echoes this move away from a focus on Latin America in her discussion of magical realism as an element of world literature. Faris suggests that magical realism is so popular in various national literatures because "it has provided the literary ground for significant cultural work; within its texts, marginal voices, submerged traditions, and emergent literatures have developed and created masterpieces." While Tabucchi's work draws on established (rather than emergent) literatures, it does in fact attempt to recover "marginalized voices" and "submerged traditions" of a people and place apparently lost to official history.

In examining the relationship between *Piazza d'Italia* and the magical realist genre, it is important to return to the first two elements on Wendy Faris's descriptive list. These are the two elements that comprise the term "magical realism." Like the historical novel, magical realism is a hybrid genre; both genres unite the seemingly opposing forms contained in their names. Magical realism differs from fantastic literature because the realistic and magical elements of the narrative are presented as harmonious elements of a unified narrative; the "magical" elements are not meant to incite fright or disbelief. Chanady describes the use of magical realism in Miguel Angel Asturias as follows:

Unlike the traditional fantastic narrative [...] in which the supernatural is portrayed as unacceptable and threatening to the world of reason, magical realism in Asturias juxtaposes two worldviews without establishing a hierarchy between them, thus relativizing the dominant Western rational paradigm.<sup>17</sup>

There is a sense in magical realist texts that the narrative occurs within the "phenomenal world." The narrative does not unfold in an alternative universe or in a dream. Rather, the magical elements are introduced into the "real world" and presented as realistic; there is no narrative comment to suggest that the point of contact between the two worldviews should be interpreted as frightening or doubtful.

Doubt arises on the part of the reader who, while immersed in a realistic depiction of the world of the text that is similar to the world

outside the text, suddenly encounters a moment that does not appear to conform to reality. Wendy Faris describes this moment of hesitation as central to magical realism. She explains that "magical things 'really' do happen," but:<sup>18</sup>

[...] before categorizing the irreducibl[y magical] element as irreducible, the reader may hesitate between two contradictory understandings of events, and hence experience some unsettling doubts. The question of belief is central here, this hesitation frequently stemming from the implicit clash of cultural systems within the narrative, which moves toward belief in extrasensory phenomena but narrates from the post-Enlightenment perspective and in the realistic mode that traditionally exclude them.<sup>19</sup>

Both Faris and Chanady point to one of the most important elements of magical realism as hybrid genre: through the imbrication of worldviews, it attempts to interrogate the privileging of certain forms of narration and historiography over others. Historiography, from the Enlightenment era to the present, has often discounted or simply ignored representations of experience that cannot be verified through acceptable forms of "evidence." Carlo Ginzburg points to this problem in describing the difficulty encountered by microhistorians attempting to reconstruct the lives of people for whom written accounts and records played little part, leaving few of the written traces that normally form the basis of historical research and writing.<sup>20</sup>

Piazza d'Italia does not have as many magical occurrences as texts like Cien años de soledad, yet there are still several such moments in the novel. One example includes the transformation of Esperia. After her son Garibaldo leaves for Argentina, each of her fingers lights up with "fiammelle celesti." Her reaction is a bit surprising because at the first onset of this transformation, in typical magical realist fashion, Esperia does not appear to be concerned by the situation. Eventually the blue light spreads and she becomes "tutta celeste, non per fuoco, ma per una chiarità interna, come quella dei luccioloni senza le ali." When Esperia goes to Zelmira to discuss this change, Zelmira speculates that Esperia is becoming a saint. Yet Esperia decides to hold off on drawing conclusions, saying, "Con tutte queste cose moderne che hanno scoperto ora dell'elettricità. E poi magari è soltanto la nostalgia del mare." Esperia

instantly adjusts to the change: "Alle fiammelle ci si era abituata subito, le facevano compagnia. Si accendevano la sera e luccicavano tranquille, senza bruciare le lenzuola. Parevano le meduse fosforescenti della sua spiaggia nelle notti d'agosto." <sup>24</sup> The idea of a woman who turns a phosphorescent blue every night does not conform to the reality that readers will bring to their reading of *Piazza d'Italia*. Yet in the text, this magic "really" happens. It is not easily explained away by the guesses forwarded by Esperia or Zelmira (sainthood, electricity, or nostalgia). The narrator presents this "magic" as fact. The narrative itself does not present doubts as to the reality of this occurrence. This moment also has strong resonance with García Márquez-style magical realism, as the magic that makes Esperia blue brings her comfort when all of the men in her life are gone, and she is thus a figure imbued with solitude.

There are other magical moments, such as the flight of Borgo's windows, which occurs twice in the novel, always as a warning against impending trouble. Another example is the representation of heredity. Despite the fact that Volturno dies in Africa, the narrator states quite clearly that Esperia gives birth to his child as a result of thinking about him so much.<sup>25</sup> Much of the magic in the novel is related to the passage of time. Following the birth of her son, long before her transformation into the "donna celeste," Esperia undergoes a transformation that involves the passage of time that is unusual, and could perhaps be described as magical. The narrator explains, "Poi, subito dopo, diventò sterile. Invecchiò da un giorno all'altro, senza drammi e rossori, si fece piccina, si chiuse in un guscio di nero."26 The description of this change as an overnight occurrence does not conform to the reader's sense of "normal" time, yet it is again presented as real fact rather than as exaggeration. The narrator provides a similar description of the growth of childhood friends Garibaldo and Gavure: "Quell'anno fu un'estate così lunga che a settembre erano già adulti."27 This description is not realistic; it can be read as a hyperbole indicating a narrative time shift or a magical realistic flourish that resembles quite closely the world of fairy tale or fable.

An interesting similarity between the Italian fable tradition and magical realism emerges in reading Italo Calvino's thoughts on the history of the fable in Italy. In his introduction to the 1962 collection *Fiabe italiane*, Calvino notes the uniqueness of Italian fables in comparison to the much more widely known German fables. According to Calvino, this singularity derives from the Italian fable's reliance on realistic settings instead of a more unrealistic fable world. <sup>28</sup>The element of fable is

also important in *Piazza d'Italia*, and the Italian fable tradition converges with the magical real in the novel. The two genres are closely connected and in fact overlap throughout the text. The subtitle of the novel points to this influence on Tabucchi's text, labeling it a "favola popolare." This phrase points to the *favola* as an organizing structure for the novel while modifying it with the term *popolare* and thus associating it with folk tradition and the masses.

#### HISTORICAL ACTORS AND THE STAGES OF HISTORICAL ACTION

Piazza d'Italia opens with an epilogue that addresses many of the key elements of the novel's exploration of Italian national history. It begins with an act of violence: the character Garibaldo is shot in the head in a piazza. As he falls to the ground, he utters "Abbasso il re!" – an exclamation that very few in the piazza's crowd hear. <sup>29</sup> The omniscient narrator explains that as the stone Garibaldo held in his hand falls, Garibaldo realizes that the bullet did not come from the royal guard, for Italy is no longer ruled by a monarch but is now a constitutional republic. The fact that the novel begins with an epilogue highlights the alteration of linear temporality. The confusion of temporality is heightened when the reader encounters a character named Garibaldo, whose name is a rough equivalent of the historical figure Giuseppe Garibaldi, and then learns that the epilogue is in fact not set in Garibaldi's nineteenth century, but rather in the post-World War II Italian Republic.

The name of the protagonist, Garibaldo, evokes the history of Italian unification during the Risorgimento, but Garibaldo does not represent a unifying figure. The epilogue is titled "S'è sciolto il fiocco." This title indicates an undoing, which is evident in the fragmentation of both the narrative structure and the content of the text. The narrator compares the untying of a black bow to the scattering of the crowd following Garibaldo's fatal shooting. Additionally, Garibaldo is presented in a stance of resistance. He carries a stone which he does not succeed in throwing before being shot, showing his powerlessness when facing the firepower of "tutti quei caschi in fila" that represent the reigning institutionalized power of his era. This position of resistance is further emphasized by Garibaldo's confused words. His final utterance places Garibaldo squarely in opposition to authority figures, whether it be the king or someone else.

Garibaldo's confusion indeed points to the continuity of power as the reader sees later in the protagonists' references to the Tuscan grand duke, the king of Italy, Mussolini, and Democracy, as various incarnations of "padroni." The specific language rhetorically nullifies the differences between heads of regional and national government, and the governing principle of democracy, presenting them all as figures that necessarily oppose the interests of Garibaldo, who throughout the novel becomes a representative *contadino*. Moreover, the protagonists make no distinction between governmental figures and wealthy non-governmental figures, describing them only abstractly, as "signori" and "stronzi che stanno in panciolle" who benefit from government actions at the cost of the lives of peasants.

This interchangeability of power is presented in one of the focal points of the piazza: the monument. The monument first comprises a statue of the grand duke of Tuscany. When that monument is replaced following Giuseppe Garibaldi's expedition, it depicts Garibaldi handing a baby girl to the king, the child representing Italy. Yet that king is replaced over the years by statues of Mussolini and later a personification of Democracy. These figures remain inanimate statues, figuring little in the daily lives of the protagonists. Tabucchi's novel does not focus on the lives of those in power, but rather on the lives of non-powerful protagonists as they navigate the shifts implemented by those governmental changes.

The other protagonist introduced in the epilogue is Asmara, Garibaldo's long-time partner. Her name, like Garibaldo's, has strong historical resonance. It is a toponym referring to the capital of Eritrea, and recalls Italian late-nineteenth and early twentieth century African colonial conquests.<sup>34</sup> In her first textual appearance, Asmara runs to the piazza and toward Garibaldo. The narrator describes her as "scalza, vestita di un incredibile grembiule con due enormi fragole ricamate sulle tasche."35 Her physical appearance, like Garibaldo's, is marked by its contrast to the row of helmets that metonymically refers to the forces of social control. Her movement also marks her difference; she runs towards Garibaldo in contrast to the crowd that disperses, moving away from Garibaldo, as well as the policemen or soldiers who stand still as forces of order. Her body, in Foucauldian terms, is not "disciplined." <sup>36</sup> She runs barefoot, denoting her status as a contadina who lives on the land and is not tied to a metropolitan center despite Borgo's increasing modernization. Her clothing is not a product of modern industrial production but rather of popular female craft. Her apron associates her with the space of the home and with the traditional role of women. Yet the reader learns

through the rest of the novel that Asmara in many situations bucks the constrictions imposed by traditional gender roles.

Asmara shows her resistance to traditional gender roles when she is not allowed to pursue her dream of becoming a horsewoman on the maremma and she is instead taught to embroider. This prohibition sparks her disdain for the dismissiveness that accompanies notions of male superiority. She does not allow Garibaldo to wield power over her. She is the one who makes decisions regarding the progress of their relationship, refusing to marry him for decades and continuing to live on her own in her home even after they do marry. When Garibaldo dismisses one of her ideas regarding political organization because he believes that as a woman she could not possibly know about wider political issues, Asmara ushers him from her home with the statement, "Ti credi bravo perché pisci al muro." Despite Garibaldo's inability to conceive of Asmara as politically engaged, she in fact participates in Partisan activities during World War II and Garibaldo learns much later that she was a distributor of anti-fascist newspapers during the Mussolini regime.

Asmara is not the only character whose name is a toponym. At birth, the Garibaldo that the reader meets in the epilogue is named Volturno after his uncle (and father); when his apparent physical father, the original Garibaldo, dies, the second Volturno inherits his name. The original Garibaldo and Volturno are sons of Plinio and Esterina. Esterina gives birth twice, first to two male twins named Quarto and Volturno. Plinio, who had a small role in the Garibaldi's "Mille" expedition, names the twins in commemoration of place–names that refer to the beginning and end points of that expedition. Esterina's second birth results in another set of twins, one male and one female, named Garibaldo and Anita in clear reference to the "eroe dei due mondi" and his wife.

These historically resonant first names are the only names provided, as most of the characters are not given surnames in the novel. Only one character—Gavure—is given a last name in the text. Gastone Vuretti is called Gavure because his stuttering produces this sound when he attempts to pronounce his full name. Gavure's name should aurally recall to the reader Cavour (Camillo Benso, count of Cavour), another important Risorgimento figure. Descriptions of Gavure's physical appearance (whose most conspicuous aspect is his hunched back) and political inclinations, however, might cause the reader to notice Gavure's resemblance to Antonio Gramsci. 39

The attribution of historically significant names to the novel's characters that represent figures largely ignored by official history has the effect of reducing the focus on the original Garibaldi and Volturno, while valorizing the experiences of the Garibaldos and Volturnos of the novel. This shift changes the value of those names, allowing the burden of official history to be lifted. There are twins and descendants whose names repeat; the men are not singular figures, but rather figures who inherit characteristics and activities, exchanging names and identities. For this reason, Tabucchi's text is not an "antistoria," but rather an alternative history. It is not a rejection of the notion of tracing threads of past experiences, but rather questions the choices made by historians in terms of the historical threads that they choose to follow.

Tabucchi's choice of protagonists, along with the decision to place figures of national power in the abstract background of the novel, signifies a shift in the focus of historical discourse. Tabucchi has asserted that his novel is an attempt to tell Italian history, and his novel shifts from traditional national historiography, which focuses on the most powerful historical actors, such as kings, generals, and presidents. 40 Instead, the protagonists of Piazza d'Italia are cinnamon cutters, the unemployed, poachers, a remarkably beautiful nun, wives, mothers, prophets, a priest who preaches Christian socialism, a hunchback, storytellers, anarchists, communists, and a cowardly fascist. Their stories would probably be lost to official accounts of national history. Not only do they not figure into official histories, but many of them actively resist the forces of history that move to marginalize them. For example, Plinio hurls his amputated foot at the Vatican in a defiant gesture against the pope on his way back home from his service to Garibaldi. Plinio later dies during his poaching activities, which he carries out in defiance of game keepers in order to provide for his family. His son Garibaldo, after shooting off his pinky toe in order to avoid being sent to fight in Africa, is killed while leading Borgo's townspeople to raid the granary so that they can feed their starving families. The next Garibaldo, the character that the reader meets in the epilogue, loses several toes while fighting in the trenches during World War I. He goes on to fight with the Partisans in the Resistance movement during the Second World War. He dies in the piazza after the war while speaking out against the ruling order of the Democrazia Cristiana political party and heckling the carabinieri that watch him. Thus, the heroes of Piazza d'Italia are characters like Garibaldo and

Asmara rather than the figures of Garibaldi, King Vittorio Emanuele II. or Mussolini.

In her critical text on Antonio Tabucchi, Flavia Brizio-Skov ties Tabucchi's shift in historical focus in *Piazza d'Italia* to trends in historiography of the 1960s and 1970s, especially microhistory because of its focus on the lives of individuals. Brizio-Skov describes the change in the historical research as follows:

Da quando la Storia non è più fatta di 're e battaglie,' la nuova storia parte dalla base della piramide sociale e, attraverso donne, bambini, criminali, emarginati, minoranze etniche o religiose, e il loro interagire con le leggi, il potere, le classi del clero o della nobiltà, ricostruisce tutta una società. Naturalmente, partire dalla base della piramide comporta dei problemi, poiché esistono pochi 'resti' e quelli che esistono sono sporadici o confusi. Spesso dunque il microstorico si ritrova a cercare nei documenti quello che il testo rivela senza volere, il non-detto.<sup>41</sup>

Like microhistorians, Tabucchi focuses on the quotidian as well as the major events in the lives of people at the "base of the social pyramid" as a way to better understand the greater social picture of a given historical period.

Lukács notes that the hero of the historical novels of Sir Walter Scott are not the exceptional figures of Romantic literature, but rather "middling" characters that do not side passionately with any element of the political crises of their time. 42 Greatly influenced by Scott, Manzoni's I promessi sposi features protagonists that learn to avoid politics and to rely on their Catholic faith rather than to work politically to change the iniquities that keep the lovers apart in the novel. At the harmonious end of the novel, Renzo explains the lessons he learns over the course of his adventures: "Ho imparato [...] a non mettermi ne' tumulti: ho imparato a non predicare in piazza [...]."43 While Tabucchi no doubt draws on the historical novel tradition, his choice of characters signals a distinct political departure from a text like Manzoni's. Rather than choosing "middling" characters as protagonists, he focuses on marginalized figures who nonetheless struggle to participate and to impact their political circumstances, even if they lose. Tabucchi's characters do not follow the model of Manzoni's that learn not to speak in the piazza;

rather, Tabucchi's characters continue to register their dissent in this public space. This group of characters also differs from other post-war novels that focus on marginalized figures in that Tabucchi presents a genealogy of characters who engage in resistance to the forces of the nation during major historical moments including the creation of governments, colonial expansion, and war. Despite the fact that the novel's characters continue to lose their battles, they refuse passivity and insist on continuing their inherited struggle for justice.

The setting of the novel is equally as important as the choice of characters. Just as *Piazza d'Italia* focuses on characters representing people who are normally not the subject of historiographic representations of the nation, the novel also examines alternative locations for historical action. History is not presented in metropolitan centers, national capitals, or battlegrounds. Instead, the novel is set in Borgo, and the narrative remains focused on this town throughout. Any action that takes place outside Borgo happens, to borrow a cinematic term, "off camera;" those moments are referenced or described rather than represented directly by the narrator. Several of the male characters, for example, travel abroad—to Paris, New York, and Buenos Aires—but those moments are only briefly described in accounts given by the characters in letters or after their physical return to Borgo. The narration does not move with these male characters to foreign settings.

Borgo is a fictional town set in Tabucchi's native region of Tuscany. The name might bring to mind the town of Macondo, the fictional town at the heart of Gabriel García Márquez's Cien años de soledad.44 Like Borgo, Macondo is a fictional town that is the primary setting for a novel based on a family saga. Macondo is set in an anonymous Latin American nation, though it is based on García Márquez's home town of Aracataca in Colombia. Both towns are meant to be representative places in order to help illuminate issues facing the larger regions and nations discussed in the two novels. This fact is especially clear in Tabucchi's case, as the name of the town "Borgo" is generic; it is a term simply meaning "town" or "village." The implication, then, is that what happens in this specific town is indicative of the history that has occurred in other towns in Italy. The fact that Borgo is meant to be a representative place of the nation is elucidated by the title. Though the piazza referred to in the title refers in fact to the piazza of Borgo, it also alludes to the piazza of the nation.<sup>45</sup> As noted above, the piazza is the space that represents official national history in the symbolism of its monument. This

choice of language that associates Borgo's piazza with the nation by extension associates the town itself with the nation. Despite the town's specificity in terms of its regional location, it is a town that represents the history lost in the construction of the nation. There are, after all, no historians in Borgo; the stories that the protagonists pass on are all part of an oral culture rather than a written one. Yet this very fact ties it to a greater peasant culture whose history is increasingly lost to historians yet still retains importance for cultural and social historians attempting to understand the past.

Decades after he wrote *Il formaggio e i vermi* (published one year after Piazza d'Italia), famed microhistorian Carlo Ginzburg described the popularity of the book across translations into dozens of languages around the world. In part, he attributed to the book's setting its ability to address concerns across cultures. Il formaggio e i vermi is a recreation of the life of a miller named Menocchio who lived in Montereale, a small village in Friuli, in the 1500s. Menocchio's religious ideas and worldview brought him to the attention of the Inquisition, and Ginzburg's work seeks to recreate Menocchio's world. Ginzburg explained the popularity of the book while receiving an award in the town of Montereale as follows: "Montereale è più facilmente comunicabile a un pubblico peruviano o giapponese di una vicenda di storia italiana."46 Ginzburg sees sixteenth century Montereale as a place that is more easily "communicable" than accounts of official Italian national history, despite its small specificity, because it is a place that draws on oral culture and village life. In his novel, Antonio Tabucchi also draws on this concept as a way of presenting the local culture of Borgo as a representative Italian town. Borgo is a town that seems removed from the larger national life, but nonetheless affected by its changes. Throughout the novel, Borgo attains a certain universality, representing social structures excluded from accounts of the emerging nation.

One focus of life in Borgo is the space of the piazza. It is the public space in which Garibaldo's resistance to national government is staged in opposition to the presence of the ever-adapting monument. Yet the piazza is not so clearly coded as the site of the spectacle of overwhelming power. There are other elements in the piazza besides the monument. One of these is the movie theater, Splendore (later Splendor). The cinema is a place of unstable significance. When it opens, it shows *Cabiria*, a movie associated with fascist re-readings under Mussolini. The movie is preceded by fascist propaganda in the form of a now-famous

Mussolini speech that begins with the phrase "Combattenti di terra, di mare!"<sup>47</sup> Yet this site is also later used for a "comizio popolare sui problemi della fabbrica," an event held by Communists.<sup>48</sup> Another element of the piazza is Gavure's newspaper stand. During fascism, Gavure sells officially sanctioned newspapers and reading material, while also using the stand as a hub from which to distribute subversive, anti-fascist literature. Anti-government forces also use the public space in order to disseminate their ideas, though often covertly.

The piazza is only one geographical element of the town and the novel's narrative. Another important site in the novel is the family home. It is in the home that the greater historical dramas play out in the lives of the protagonists. The lives of the women—Esterina, Esperia, and Asmara—unfold almost exclusively in this space. It is also here that the men communicate their political ideas. Brizio–Skov notes that most institutions are shown to be unstable and unreliable in the novel, while the family remains the only stable force:

La famiglia rimane l'unico nucleo su cui possono contare. E per famiglia si intendono le donne che ne fanno parte, spose e madri coraggiose che vengono private, chi prima chi dopo, del marito, che da sole lottano, allevano i figli, aiutano gli amici, salvano i compaesani.<sup>49</sup>

By extension, the home is the only space that offers refuge from the privations of national history.

Tabucchi's focus on local culture in *Piazza d'Italia* has political relevance. As has been noted by many critics, Tabucchi has embraced the idea of *impegno* in his literary and journalistic work. <sup>50</sup> Some critics see Tabucchi's earliest work, including *Piazza d'Italia*, as relatively anomalous for its regional flavor in both setting and language. <sup>51</sup> This is because much of his later, better known work is set outside of Italy—France, Portugal, and various cosmopolitan settings. Yet Tabucchi does not appear to make much distinction in terms of those settings in relationship to his political commitment. In an article, he addresses these concerns:

Il mio impegno consiste nell'indagare la realtà con occhi altrui. Spesso la critica un po' snob di certi giornali mi ha attribuito una presunta iperletterarietà troppo cosmopolita. E perché no: anche dal mio paesello natale, quando ci sto, mi piace occuparmi del mondo, perché il mondo mi riguarda. Lo stesso valeva per Leonardo Sciascia, che della Sicilia è riuscito a fare un paradigma letterario: poteva essere letto benissimo come uno scrittore regionalista, ma è riuscito a elevare il suo paese a una metafora universale. Il suo impegno consisteva in questo. <sup>52</sup>

Tabucchi's assertion here regarding Sciascia's use of his small town as a "metafora universale" echoes Carlo Ginzburg's discussion of Montereale. Tabucchi forwards the notion that a focus on the local can have greater resonance. Indeed, readers and critics noted the resonance of his 1994 novel *Sostiene Pereira* for Italy under Berlusconi despite the fact that it is set in 1930s Portugal.<sup>53</sup> This is common in historical fiction, which often indirectly comments on the contemporary context through its exploration of the past.

Tabucchi's shifts in characters and settings for his account of history is a strategy that has become ever more prevalent in historiography beginning in the 1970s, though microhistorians and "metahistorians" (like Hayden White) drew in part on the work of earlier schools such as Annales and Marxist historiography.<sup>54</sup> The mark of these historiographic shifts is evident in other Italian novels of the postwar period, including Elsa Morante's very popular novel *La Storia*, published just two years before *Piazza d'Italia*, which examines World War II by focusing on characters with the lowest social capital.<sup>55</sup> While Tabucchi's novel has the same spirit of desire to shift the protagonists of history, he does not use the literary realism that is the dominant mode of Morante's *La Storia*. Tabucchi's novel draws on various non-realist genres, including elements of magical realism. This allows Tabucchi to counter not just the content of conventional Italian national history, providing diverse content through an alternative narrative form.

### OPENING THE CIRCLE: THE READER AS INTERPRETER

Despite the circular nature of Tabucchi's novel, the ending of the novel provides an interpretive question that can only be answered by the reader. The openness of the text to interpretation links it to postmodernist texts, including other magical realist novels. According to Faris, magical realism "registers a discourse of plurality, of disagreement." In discussing another magical realist novel, Faris asserts that it

[...] extends narrative hands to its readers, inviting them to weave their own interpretations out of the loose ends of story that remain untied [...]. That kind of unfinished, nonexclusive discourse, in conjunction with the contiguous worlds of the past, of literature, of dreams and imagination that course through the text, models a fruitful exchange of stories and worlds, a nontotalitarian kind of discourse.<sup>57</sup>

Magical realism often uses this tactic of positing different possibilities and requiring the intervention of the reader to create meaning in order to resist dominant discourses that rely on univocality and in so doing preclude other possible interpretations. Magical realism instead welcomes divergent literary forms as a way to reproduce the plurality of experiences and interpretations of a given reality.

The opening of the text to the reader's input is evident at the end of Piazza d'Italia. The appendix, which unlike the epilogue occupies the "normal" place at the physical end of the novel, provides an interpretive challenge to the reader; titled "Il segreto della Zelmira," it describes the strega's final words. The narrator explains that her death occurs "oltre la fine di questa storia."58 This description adds another temporal disjunction to the novel. While the overarching narrative is presented in the form of one big circle, with the ending referring back to the beginning, the appendix provides an opening in the circle by discussing a point in history that occurs after the end. The actions presented in the appendix also force the reader into the role of interpreter if s/he is to make sense of Zelmira's final words. The fact that Zelmira is still alive at the end of the novel is surprising in itself; considering the chronology of the work, she must be extremely old by this point, as she was consulted by several generations of Garibaldo's family and appears to have outlived most of them. At the end of her days, Zelmira finally decides to reveal the secret truth that Don Milvio told her before retreating to the hills in order to live a life of silence and solitude. With failing breath, Zelmira manages to say, "Don Milvio mi disse che l'uguaglianza non si ottiene con le macchine idrauliche."59

This focus on last words recalls the beginning of the text which reproduces Garibaldo's final words. It also harkens back to the first Garibaldo's death in his attempts to execute Don Milvio's plan of creating a way to distribute grain equally to the residents of Borgo. At the same time, Zelmira's final words present a puzzle for the reader, which

Brizio-Skov describes as a "rebus," because they require the reader to wonder how equality can be obtained if the machine envisioned by Don Milvio cannot accomplish this goal. 60 Zelmira's statement seems to suggest that a simple model of redistribution cannot bring equality. Yet no other answer is provided to this question by the novel. Zelmira's revelation of Don Milvio's statement is an open ending that requires interpretation. Those words could be construed negatively (equality is unattainable) or positively (equality is attainable, though in a way not attempted by the protagonists whose efforts at resistance appear to fail in changing their social structure). Either way, the narrative does not answer this question but leaves it to the reader to find a workable response to the interpretive challenge. This open ending supports a vision of history that is open to reinterpretation and requires participation.

#### Notes

- 1. Tabucchi, Antonio. *Piazza d'Italia. Favola popolare in tre tempi, un epilogo e un'appendice.* 1975, 1993. Milano: Feltrinelli, 2001. 62.
- 2. The original 1975 edition of the novel did not include the subtitle *Favola popolare in tre tempi, un epilogo e un'appendice*. In his "Nota alla seconda edizione," Tabucchi notes, "[Ripubblico il libro] tale e quale come era, ripristinando il primitivo sottotitolo, al quale fu preferita la dizione 'romanzo.'" *Piazza d'Italia* 7.
- 3. "In these first novels, one notices a certain influence of García Márquez. Both are family sagas whose protagonists share, beyond the same names, the vocation of rebels and a horrible destiny" (my translation). Gumpert Melgosa, Carlos and Xavier González Rovira. Conversaciones con Antonio Tabucchi. Barcelona: Editorial Anagrama, 1995. 141.
- 4. "Yes, perhaps, but in any case it is merely a superficial influence because in reality those of García Márquez are one hundred years of solitude while those I talk about are one hundred years of participation" (my translation). Antonio Tabucchi qtd. in Gumpert 141.
- 5. Faris, Wendy B. Ordinary Enchantments: Magical Realism and the Remystification of Narrative. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt UP, 2004. 7.
  - 6. Piazza d'Italia 12.
  - 7 Ibid 93
  - 8. Ibid 26.

- 9. Perhaps the earliest piece of Italian scholarship on *Cien años de soledad* is Cesare Segre's 1969 essay called "Il tempo curvo di García Márquez." Not surprisingly, the essay focuses on García Márquez's representation of temporality in the novel. Segre, Cesare. "Il tempo curvo di García Márquez." *I segni e la critica*. Torino: Giulio Einaudi Editore, 1969. One of the few Italian critics to note the similarities between *Piazza d'Italia* and *Cien años de soledad* is Claudio Pezzin in his 2000 book on Antonio Tabucchi, which also cites Segre's essay. Pezzin, Claudio. *Antonio Tabucchi*. Sommacampagna (Verona): Cierre Edizioni, 2000. 14.
  - 10. Piazza d'Italia 11.
  - 11. García Márquez 9.
- 12. Chanady, Amaryll. "The Territorialization of the Imaginary in Latin America: Self-Affirmation and Resistance to Metropolitan Paradigms." *Magical Realism: Theory, History, Community*. Eds. Lois Parkinson Zamora and Wendy B. Faris. Durham, NC: Duke UP, 1995. 138.
- 13. This loss of faith in historical progress is also an important element in postmodern theory. In his essay attempting a definition of postmodernism, Lyotard explains, "One can note a sort of decay in the confidence placed by the two last centuries in the idea of progress. This idea of progress as possible, probable or necessary was rooted in the certainty that the development of the arts, technology, knowledge and liberty would be profitable to mankind as a whole." Lyotard, Jean-François. "Defining the Postmodern." *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism.* Ed. Vincent B. Leitch. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2001. 1613. Lyotard cites Auschwitz as one example for the erosion of confidence in historical progress following World War II.
  - 14. Chanady 141.
- 15. See Guenther, Irene. "Magical Realism, New Objectivity, and the Arts during the Weimar Repulic." *Magical Realism: Theory, History, Community*. Eds. Lois Parkinson Zamora and Wendy B. Faris. Durham, NC: Duke UP, 1995.
  - 16 Faris 1
  - 17. Chanady 141.
  - 18. Faris 8.
  - 19. Ibid 17.
- 20. Ginzburg, Carlo. Il formaggio e i vermi. Il cosmo di un mugnaio del '500. Torino: Einaudi, 1976. XI.
  - 21. Piazza d'Italia 75.
  - 22. Ibid 76.
  - 23. Ibid 76.
  - 24. Ibid 76.
  - 25. Ibid 43.

- 26. Ibid.
- 27. Ibid 58.
- 28. Calvino, Italo. "Introduzione." Fiabe italiane. Raccolte dalla tradizione popolare durante gli ultimi cento anni e trascritte in lingua dai vari dialetti. Torino: Giulio Einaudi Editore, 1962.
  - 29. Ibid 11.
  - 30. Ibid 12.
  - 31. Ibid 17, 88, 96, 122, 144.
  - 32. Ibid 20.
  - 33. Ibid 28.
- 34. The rhetorical role of Africa in fascist ideology is further elucidated in the description of Melchiorre's writing. Melchiorre, an ambivalent fascist, writes serialized short stories about a character named Italo Ferro, a name with a clear reference to nationalism and strength. The narrator describes one of Melchiorre's short stories, which has clear racist and colonialist force behind it: "ora stava scrivendo un terzo episodio di Italo alle prese con una tribù di negri piccoli e lascivi che andavano a rapire ragazze bianche sulla costa per sacrificarle ai loro idoli di pietra." Ibid 81.
  - 35. Ibid 12.
- 36. On the notion of "discipline," see Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Trans. Alan Sheridan. 1977. New York: Vintage, 1995.
  - 37. Ibid 88.
- 38. When Volturno dies during his military activities in Africa, Esperia (Volturno's first love) marries Volturno's younger brother, Garibaldo. She gives birth to a son long after Volturno's death, yet the narrator describes Garibaldo's (né Volturno) paternity as follows: "[Esperia aveva] pensato a Volturno così intensamente che a febbraio ebbe un figlio da lui dopo tanto tempo che era morto. Aveva lo stesso viso candido e i capelli di fiamma e gli occhi bianchi e lontani, pieni di parole segrete." Ibid 43.
- 39. In her essay on *Piazza d'Italia*, Norma Bouchard notes the importance of Gramscian political and historical thought to the novel. She suggests that the novel "follows a Gramscian model of historiography" that sees the Risorgimento as a "failed revolution." Bouchard, Norma. "Reopening the Risorgimento Archive: Spectrality and Utopia in Antonio Tabucchi's *Piazza d'Italia*." *Risorgimento in Modern Italian Culture: Revisiting the 19th Century Past in History, Narrative, and Cinema*. Ed. Norma Bouchard. Cranbury, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 2005. 176. Bouchard explains that "the novel selectively activates the symbolic capital associated with the name of Garibaldi as an icon of

revolutionary and political activism, while at the same time highlighting how the ideals and aspirations of the Garibaldian tradition have been consistently betrayed." Ibid 178-179.

- 40. In an interview with Anna Botta, which was conducted in Italian but translated to English by Botta for publication, Antonio Tabucchi states, "I wrote *Piazza d'Italia* twenty years ago, when I was happy and unknown. I meant to write a short history of the last hundred years in Italy, in tragicomic style. Today it seems to me that tragicomedy is very much the current state of affairs in Italy, and this is the reason I had the idea of republishing my first novel." Botta, Anna. "An Interview with Antonio Tabucchi." *Contemporary Literature* 35.3 (Autumn 1994): 423–440. 440. In contrast, on the back cover of the 2001 edition of the 1993 republication, the novel is described as an "antistoria:""In queste pagine, l'autore tratteggia con humour e delicata malinconia un mondo contadino, arcaico, ormai scomparso, e ricostruisce con fantasiose trovate un'antistoria d'Italia dalla parte dei perdenti, una fiaba popolare pervasa dal senso, arcano ma non oscuro, della fragilità della vita."
- 41. Brizio-Skov, Flavia. *Antonio Tabucchi. Navigazioni in un arcipelago narrative*. Cosenza: Luigi Pellegrini Editore, 2002. 31.
- 42. Lukács, Georg. *The Historical Novel*. 1937. Trans. Hannah and Stanley Mitchell. Intro. Fredric Jameson. Lincoln, NE and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1962/1983.
- 43. Manzoni, Alessandro. *I promessi sposi*. 1840. Intro. Vittorio Spinazzola. Milano: Garzanti, 1999. 540.
- 44. García Márquez, Gabriel. *Cien años de soledad*. 1967. Madrid: Real Academia Española, 2007.
- 45. Brizio-Skov notes, "Il titolo avrebbe potuto essere *Piazza di Borgo*, invece è *Piazza d'Italia*. La piazza, infatti, è il luogo di collisione e confluenza di due Storie parallele, quella ufficiale e quella non ufficiale, luogo di scontro e di incontro, luogo dove un'intera comunità si riunisce da sempre per sentire le deliberazioni di chi comanda. Dai comizi di Mussolini a quelli della Democrazia Cristiana, la piazza è uno spazio reale e metaforico, fulcro di un mondo circoscritto, Borgo, e specchi dei cambiamenti storici di un'intera nazione, l'Italia." Brizio-Skov 21.
- 46. Ginzburg, Carlo. "Ma tu di dove sei?" *Un mugnaio, uno storico, un libro. Carlo Ginzburg*, Il formaggio e i vermi, 1976-2002. Ed. Aldo Colonnello and Andrea Del Col. Trieste: Edizioni Università di Trieste, 2003. 156.
  - 47 Piazza d'Italia 98
  - 48. Ibid 122.
  - 49. Brizio-Skov 47.

- 50. See Brizio-Skov; Burns, Jennifer. Fragments of Impegno: Interpretations of Commitment in Contemporary Italian Narrative, 1980-2000. Leeds, UK: Northern Universities Press, 2001.; Wren-Owens, Elizabeth. Postmodern Ethics: The Re-appropriation of Committed Writing in the Works of Antonio Tabucchi and Leonardo Sciascia. Newcastle, UK: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2007.; and Francese, Joseph. Socially Symbolic Acts: The Historicizing Fictions of Umberto Eco, Vincenzo Consolo, and Antonio Tabucchi. Cranbury, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson UP, 2006.
- 51. Brizio-Skov provides an excellent discussion of the use of Tuscan language in *Piazza d'Italia*. She describes the language of the narrator as "un linguaggio colorito, rustico, spigliato, tipico della tradizione orale." Brizio-Skov 38.
- 52. Tabucchi, Antonio. L'oca al passo. Notizie dal buio che stiamo attraversando. Milano: Feltrinelli, 2006. 131.
- 53. Tabucchi, Antonio. *Sostiene Pereira. Una testimonianza.* 1994. Milano: Feltrinelli, 2003.
- 54. See Iggers, Georg G. Historiography in the Twentieth Century: From Scientific Objectivity to the Postmodern Challenge. Hanover, NH: Wesleyan University Press/University Press of New England, 1997.
  - 55. Morante, Elsa. La Storia. Torino: Einaudi, 1974.
  - 56. Faris 144.
  - 57. Ibid 142.
  - 58. Piazza d'Italia 149.
  - 59. Ibid 150.
  - 60. Brizio-Skov 52.