

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

In Search of Columbus: The Sources for the First Voyage. By David Henige.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4fx5t3dc>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 16(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Mathes, W. Michael

Publication Date

1992-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Unfortunately, this level of precision is not uniformly present in *Chaco & Hohokam*. Much interpretive disarray is evident in the ranks of the contributors to this volume, and what emerges from their effort is far from a single view of either the Chacoans or the Hohokam. Instead, widely divergent interpretations of both groups are offered by contributors. The issues in the book that generate the most heat (and the least light) are those related to sociopolitical organization, decision-making complexity, vertical hierarchy, and social control. The chapters dealing with these issues underscore the remarkable diversity of opinion current among researchers who all have access to, and base their interpretations on, the same data. I find it a worrisome state of affairs for the field that no common language or interpretive currency has emerged to identify, describe, and explain the correlates of inequality in social, political, and economic affairs. Nevertheless, I commend this book to readers of prehistory. It clearly sets forth the state of current knowledge of the Chacoans and the Hohokam. If that is something less than hoped for, perhaps others will be inclined to the challenge.

Steadman Upham

In Search of Columbus: The Sources for the First Voyage. By David Henige. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press, 1991. 359 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

Between August 1492 and March 1493, Christopher Columbus, a relatively unknown navigator commanding three inferior ships with equally substandard crews, made what may well be the most important voyage in the history of mankind, for it brought the planet into realistic geographic and ethnographic perspective for the first time. Five hundred years after the event, its impact is still being experienced in both positive and negative fashion. The first, second, and third centenaries of the 1492 Columbian voyage found the lands it had opened for the most part still within the colonial world, and commemoration was ignored, although the fourth centenary in 1892 brought festivities in which various nations participated.

Now, on the eve of the fifth centenary, virtually the entire community of nations is involved in the "Encounter of Two Worlds." While there are always those who focus on the negative

aspects of any event to create disturbance and destruction, millions of dollars and thousands of people in dozens of nations are positively creating employment and income through commemorative programs. Everything from academic congresses and publications to theater, film, coinage, postage stamps, t-shirts, bumper stickers, and virtually anything else promotional of the Quincentenary is in process. Spain, Columbus's adopted homeland, is holding the World Expo in Seville, center of Spanish expansion to America, and the Olympic Games in Barcelona, the port to which Columbus returned in 1493. *In Search of Columbus: The Sources for the First Voyage*, a new addition to Columbian bibliography by David Henige, is an important contribution to this output.

While Henige's book is clearly not for those with only a marginal interest in Columbus, it is unique and extraordinary within its field and is a fundamental requisite for all students of Columbus's first voyage. Unlike much of the other recent Columbian literature, this study does not seek to recount the voyage, establish a landfall site in the Caribbean, or discover Columbus's race, religion, or national origin. Rather, it is a classic exercise in historiography directly applicable to the first Columbian voyage and, tangentially, a prime candidate as a well-written text demonstrative of proper methodology in historical criticism.

With surgical precision, Henige first dissects the sole "primary" basis of understanding of the 1492 voyage and its many renditions and interpretations, the Columbus "Diario." After this magnificent critique, he then applies the numerous problems of the Diario to modern historiographical debate. The initial difficulty lies in the fact that the Diario is, in fact, not the diary but rather a highly modified copy, possibly as much as third generation, made by Fray Bartolomé de Las Casas sometime between 1515 and 1550 as a reference for his *Historia de las Indias*. Discovered by the great maritime historian Martín Fernández de Navarrete in 1791 and published by him in 1825, the Las Casas copy has been the cornerstone of all studies of Columbus's first voyage and is the closest known documentation of it to the event.

Thus, the Las Casas "version"—for very clearly he virtually ignored precision in matters of navigation, while concentrating on ethnography—prepared possibly as many as six decades after Columbus's return, is the most contemporary and direct account of the voyage. Add to this some questionable paleographic renditions of the Las Casas text; its having been "cleaned up" by the elimination of notes and the correction or removal of some items;

its modernization through capitalization, accenting, and punctuation, not to speak of translation; and the literal authority of what started out as an "impure" document becomes almost absurd. Nonetheless, this is the document on which modern historians have reconstructed the great voyage.

Other early documents, such as the history produced by Fernando Colón, Columbus's son, and the 1493 *Epistola*, are also studied as a means of comparison and analysis of sources. These are likewise shown to have been substantially modified through the same processes but also, in some instances, to be contradictory to the *Diario*. Sources for the 1492 voyage are, therefore, at best imprecise and subject to substantial variance in modern interpretation.

In the second part of his study, Henige skillfully attacks modern historiography that is based on this shaky documentary foundation. While evidently seeking to avoid direct criticism of current scholarship, he reviews reconstructions of routes of the voyage, details of the first sighting of land, geographic descriptions of the islands, contact with indigenous peoples, and other details used to determine the Columbian itinerary, and, of necessity, he categorizes many editions of the *Diario*.

Extensive juggling and selective recalculation of distances, suggested changes in topography over the past five centuries, and unsupported claims that adjust facts to establish a preconceived particular route and landing site seem to be almost universal. Nevertheless, the most serious bending or omission of fact is attributed to the translated edition published by Samuel Eliot Morison, which adds, deletes, exaggerates, twists, and falsifies with aplomb, and to another by Robert Fuson, which is highly selective and abridged. Greater precision in translation is attributed to the work of Oliver Dunn and James E. Kelley, and the edition produced by Manuel Alvar is considered the most accurate rendering of the original Spanish paleography. Following the text is a thorough bibliography of editions of the *Diario* and of studies of it. Also included are appendices with the Spanish text of 11–15 October 1492 and Gonzalo Fernández de Oviedo's description of the sighting of a light on the night of 11 October. An analytical index completes the book. The volume is nicely designed, printed, and bound.

I am particularly pleased with Henige's book; when I pointed out, at the San Francisco meeting of the Society for the History of Discoveries, that careful study of the *Diario* in its original form—

rather than argument over precision of translation—would be the only way a landing site could even begin to be determined, my comment brought strong arguments and protests from monolingualists. Congratulations to David Henige for a balanced, cold, and realistic approach to a widespread historiographical problem. Serious students of Columbus will appreciate the author's fine academic precision; perhaps in the future he will also produce a more popular essay that would expand the general public's understanding of the research problems attending the Quincentenary.

W. Michael Mathes

Kusiq: An Eskimo Life History from the Arctic Coast of Alaska. By Waldo Bodfish, Sr. Recorded, compiled, and edited by William Schneider, in collaboration with Leona Kisautaq Okakok and James Mumigana Nageak. Fairbanks, AL: University of Alaska Press, Oral Biography Series No. 2, 1991. 330 pages. \$21.00 paper.

Several autobiographies of northern natives have appeared in recent years, and each, among other benefits, has helped to reduce the sketchiness of the published culture history of the far north, especially that of the first half of the century—a period now remembered firsthand by only the oldest living narrators. The life history genre has also introduced us to a series of truly remarkable individuals with a wide range of personalities, skills, and knowledge and has offered a chance for true collaboration between native narrators and Western anthropologists or other interested scholars and friends. For all these reasons and more, we welcome this second volume in the series of oral biographies being published by the University of Alaska Press under the editorship of William Schneider.

Kusiq, or Waldo Bodfish, Sr., was a mixed-blood Eskimo from the Arctic coast of Alaska. As the main title indicates, he preferred the Eskimo name given to him by his mother and always valued the Eskimo way of life, hence his opening statement: "I am Eskimo. I don't want to change my nationality and I like to speak Eskimo. I'm a half-breed: Father, white man and mother, real Eskimo, from Point Hope" (p. 1). In concluding his story, he also reaffirms how fortunate he was to have lived primarily as an Eskimo: "And I got through all the days of my life without any regrets" (p. 154).