

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Earth and Sky: Visions of the Cosmos, a Native American Folklore. Edited by Ray A. Williamson and Claire R. Farrer.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7zq868d2>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 17(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Anderson, Eric

**Publication Date**

1993-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

eages) with leaders, who, for the most part, achieved their status during their lifetimes.

McGuire's concern with things beyond the material is to be applauded, as is his awareness that links between material culture, social organization, and ideology are not necessary simple and straightforward. He offers an interesting and plausible interpretation of Hohokam social organization and ideology. However, his reliance on the Yuman ethnographic data requires some additional explanation. I understand that the Hohokam cremated their dead, as did the Yuman. But, what happened to the Hohokam? Can we trace them through the practice of cremation among ethnographic peoples? And what is the relationship of the Yuman to the Hohokam? I finished the book wanting to know more about each of these issues.

A final note: There were a disturbing number of spelling and grammatical errors throughout the text (I caught seven in the last chapter alone), and the quality of the print and readability of the figures was extremely variable. This carelessness gave me cause to wonder about other parts of the text, including the accuracy of data in the tables and appendix.

*Shirley Powell*

Northern Arizona University

**Earth and Sky: Visions of the Cosmos in Native American Folklore.** Edited by Ray A. Williamson and Claire R. Farrer. Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1992. 320 pages. \$32.50 cloth.

"In the night sky over the northwestern plains the Blackfoot see the smoking star dancing" (p. 207). Rarely does an essay in a scholarly collection begin as beautifully as this; happily, Alice Kehoe's "Clot-of-Blood" not only sustains the promise of its opening sentence but keeps good company as well. All told, seventeen writers with very diverse scholarly and not-so-scholarly interests, as well as a number of native storytellers, shamans, poets, and other skywatchers, contribute to *Earth and Sky*, and, all told, the volume offers a good variety of information about the relatively new scholarly field of ethnoastronomy. It also aims and often succeeds at being something more: an enlightening example of how interdisciplinary study—at its

best a sort of loose analogy and argument for the possibility of broader cultural intersections and conversations—can imagine, respect, and be reshaped by non-Western, native North American cultural practices. As the final word in the book's subtitle indicates, Euro-American categories and perspectives still do a fair amount (though certainly not all) of the talking. On the other hand, the editors and contributors, in attempting to "correct" the scholarly (and, I presume, the popular) "imbalance . . . weighted toward Euroamerican perceptions and philosophies" of "Native American myths and tales of the sky" (p. 1), point up the difficulty of achieving, let alone maintaining, any such cross-cultural equilibrium. Their general awareness of this vexing difficulty raises important questions: Do the "myths and tales" (the "folklore") get inscribed within the "scholarly" project and the academy, or does the "Western" get inscribed and reinvented within the "myths," as, for example, in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Ceremony*? Although readers interested in large-scale theoretical or polemical discussions of such questions will not find them here, what this book does venture is the very much related suggestion that perhaps inscription itself need not figure so centrally as either an actual practice or a metaphor; the stars, the stories, the conversations promise and provide exchanges less hierarchical and more reciprocal, exchanges fundamentally and mutually courteous and respectful.

*Earth and Sky*, after all, both invites and exemplifies such exchanges. First, it brings various regional cosmovisions (defined by the editors as naked-eye observations of the cosmos, as well as their cultural significance) together, giving a powerful, overarching sense of what Kenneth Lincoln calls "culture-specific differences among tribes . . . [seen in close relation to] the pan-Indian acculturations that reunify tribal Americans among themselves and across tribes" (*Native American Renaissance*, 1983). Organized geographically, the essays (excluding the introduction and epilogue) move "on around the sunrise circle . . . purposely imitating both the Sky realm and its interaction with Earth and the motions of the celestial sphere that repeat the vast cycles that suggest to people how they should live" (p. 20). Moving from East to Southeast to Southwest and on around, the essays discuss, in order, the Seneca, Alabama, Mescalero Apache, Zuñi, Navajo (two essays), Pima and Yuma, Cahuilla, Ajumawi, North Pacific tribes (particularly Tsimshian), Blackfoot, Lakota, Skidi Pawnee, Algonkian, and, completing the circle, the Seneca. Moreover, the essays advance a

diversity of perspectives, reflecting the diversity of their authors' fields of study: anthropology, folklore, literature, astronomy, comparative religion, philosophy, mathematics, archaeology, and sacred geography, among others. The pairings of tribal cosmologies and scholarly methodologies are, to some extent, up to chance but seem by and large congenial. From my English department perspective, I appreciated the very legible, nontechnical scientific explanations as well as the refreshingly jargon-free literary approaches and the imaginative links forged between these ways of seeing. From that same perspective, I noticed striking differences in the quality of the writing from essay to essay; some of the pairings are luckier than others. Still, optimistic by nature, I stress again that what is most important here is the rich overall picture, the common purpose: the reunifying and reconfiguring of both Indian and non-Indian perspectives toward the reconnecting of each to each other and, through the sky, to the earth.

Collectively, the book conveys optimism tinged with loss over its relatively new field of inquiry, what the editors call "blue archaeoastronomy." The name is contemporary, yet again and again the book reminds us that much of its material is really not new at all; some of it originates in mythic-sacred zones that precede "new" and "old" and may not be comprehensible as categories or in verbal language alone. Much of it remains alive today in such culturally significant ways. But some of it has been acculturated out of existence, in recent or distant memory; hence "salvage ethnoastronomy" becomes the only possible option. Gods and myths become data; cultural renewal and practice give way to scholarly recovery and preservation. Voices are silenced, breaths extinguished. The understated but strongly elegiac soundings of this very difficult salvage work underscore the generally more upbeat quality of the book's seventeen chapters as they make clear not only the beauty but also the complexity and ideological significance of earth and sky to daily Indian life. "To the Ojibwa," writes Thor Conway on the basis of shamans' tales publishable because of offerings made to the resident spirits, "the knowledge preserved in the origin tale can be seen and interpreted daily in the surrounding landscape. At night, they see their history in the stars" (p. 257).

As Kehoe's first sentence demonstrates, stars inspire, as they have for centuries upon centuries inspired, lyric poetic responses that both affirm and maintain important cultural processes. Stars

make language and stars are language, a perception Claire Farrer reflects on in the epilogue to *Earth and Sky*: "Sometimes the speech of the universe is visual rather than aural" (p. 282). Translated, this speech can assume many shapes and forms, can forge and justify many (sometimes competing) ideologies. This collection of essays offers a number of creation stories and ceremonial narratives in which humans imagine and interpret stars while stars interpret and imagine humans. And what stories they are! In *Earth and Sky*, brightest light shines on the ways various Indian cultures observe, imagine, translate, and recharge a very participatory universe. Throughout, the book focuses on what Farrer, in an essay on Mescalero Apaches, calls "relationships and the metaphoric, specifically the interplay between stars and people . . . For, while surely the stars are guides to earth surface travel, the stars are also metaphoric guides to life as it should be lived" (p. 69). As such, the metaphors carry very grave responsibility; writes Ronald Goodman, "By following sacred precepts limned in sky and story, the Lakota affirm their way of living and practicing ritual not only as proper but also as essential for the continuance of the very universe" (p. 220). Naked-eye observation of the cosmos "orders and explains" both the universe and "everyday life" (p. 281), making possible the development and maintenance of ceremonial and agricultural calendars, celestial almanacs for hunter-gatherers, stories and prayers, visions and ideologies.

Although I haven't time and space to comment on each essay separately, some of the very best pieces and outstanding moments deserve specific praise. Paul Zolbrod and Thomas McElwain both use Seneca narratives to convey what McElwain eloquently calls "a mythology that . . . successfully integrates the hunter with the world of his interaction in terms of continuing life, rather than setting the hunter apart from the world as heroic because his hand is against it, its animals, its earth, and its sky" (p. 276). Direct ideological contrasts such as this are somewhat surprisingly rare in *Earth and Sky*; the editors commit themselves (and for the most part their authors) to affirming indigenous cultural systems rather than critiquing their invaders and, in some instances, destroyers. McElwain's point is therefore very well taken, particularly his emphasis on native hunters' respect for place, their courtesy to animals, and their courting of integration rather than competition, conquest, and other such tragically ironic "heroisms." Further, his examination of individual hunters' ceremonials, like

Zolbrod's study of the Seneca Thank-You Prayer, demonstrates how intangible "verbal artifacts" deeply convey not only a culture's cosmological practices but its very way of life, its "way of integrating cosmic vision and everyday living here on earth" (p. 26). Instructive here are both the similarities and the differences between Zolbrod—an English professor working from Seneca poetic evidence—and McElwain—a student and teacher of comparative religion—with the additional difference that McElwain's is a Seneca point of view.

Moving to the Southwest, where much of the ethnoastronomical work can still be done without resorting to salvage, the book offers a nourishing and thoroughly excellent piece by folklorist M. Jane Young, author of a well-received 1988 book on Zuñi rock art. "Morning Star, Evening Star: Zuñi Traditional Stories" embraces the aesthetics of cosmovision and, in so doing, expresses powerfully the complexity of "Zuñi perceptions of the interaction between the earth and the sky" (p. 75), perceptions that assume the fluidity rather than the fixity of past/present, myth/actuality, and other such binary, cultural "boundaries." Like Gary Witherspoon's work on *Language and Art in the Navajo Universe* (1977), Young's essay on the Zuñi Twin War Gods makes clear the significance of what she calls "dynamic asymmetry" (p. 75), a term very useful to understanding the Coyote-like Twin War Gods, who in their mischievous, insatiable, curious, trickster behavior point toward a Zuñi "ethos that embraces ambiguity, multivocality, and a vision of 'all possibilities'" (p. 91). Because she so brilliantly perceives "the importance of ambiguity, of multiple interpretations in Zuñi cultural symbolism" (p. 89), Young takes us very far from the sympathetic but at heart ethnocentric attitudes of such early ethnologists in Zuñi as Frank Hamilton Cushing—who apparently embraced multiple possibilities himself (scientist/imaginative artist, respectful participant-observer/petulant Smithsonian employee, adopted Zuñi/assimilationist American) without quite fully knowing it. Aware as she is of both verbal and visual ambiguities and crossings, Young demonstrates that her sophisticated contemporary methodologies speak with Zuñi cultural symbolism; indeed, her postmodern perspective seems uniquely suited to this culture, where "both spatial and temporal boundaries . . . are fluid" (p. 89). Far from intrusive, far from prone to the thinly veiled ethnocentrism of predecessors such as Cushing, her complex approach matches and wonderfully illuminates Zuñi.

And several other essays in *Earth and Sky* corroborate Young's working hypothesis. For Trudy Griffin-Pierce, an independent scholar and practicing artist who has been adopted into a Navajo family, kinship's "interrelatedness is reflected in the Navajo dwelling . . . *hooghan*, and in stories about the *hooghan* . . . the *hooghan* embodies the concept of *hozho*. The *hooghan* and the sky can also be conceptualized as reciprocals because the *hooghan* reflects cosmological order while the sky can be seen as a sort of *hooghan*" (p. 111). Living in such tangible metaphors, perceiving reciprocal exchanges between mind-body-dwelling-earth-celestial phenomena, the Navajo connect themselves deeply and ethically to earth and sky. And so do other peoples. Compare Kehoe's work on the Blackfoot, in which she pictures

the transmigrated hero Clot-of-Blood, dancing forever . . . leaving his legacy of spiritually potent tipis in the camps of the people. You may see them there today: the bear-painted and snake-painted tipis, microcosmoi with their black tops representing the sky . . . their central portions the earth with its patron creatures and the lower border of triangles or semi-circles representing mountains or hills (pp. 207-208).

Consider, too, the symbolic relationships between the people, their built structures, and their cosmivision as described by Von del Chamberlain in an essay on the Skidi Pawnee; their earth lodges provide "home and observatory as well as the confirmation of Skidi life and practices" (p. 226), and the open Plains house them "under the roof of the sky" (p. 226). Thus, particular essays in this volume often come together, enacting the sorts of beauty and unity each describes.

My quibbles with this deeply engaging book amount primarily to suggestions toward further work in the field. The prevalent unity of the collection sometimes seems a bit too undeviating, a bit too relentless; when I am not delighted by the pan-Indian connections, I am made suspicious by them. To the editors' and authors' credit, the volume emphasizes interconnectedness both within particular tribes' cosmovisions and between tribes, but these cosmovisions are often described as viable to the point of fully functioning; even the salvage work sets out to reconstruct, as completely as possible, the unbroken, not-yet invaded cultural practices. My point is simply that contact between indigenous and nonindigenous peoples shattered and sometimes extinguished these spiritual wholes: we all know

this, and several of the essays herein implicitly take it into account, in scattered, dark and elegiac passages as well as in the very act of doing salvage ethnoastronomy. Still, it seems to me that the ideological conflicts between, say, Indians and missionaries, Indians and BIA agents, Indian cosmos and Christian sky gods, might be foregrounded more often, more specifically, and even more dogmatically. How did (do) these native cosmologies come under attack? How have they persisted? In what ways have they changed? assimilated other cultures' cosmologies? resisted such assimilations and revisions? How, for example, does the Bole Maru—described by Greg Sarris as “a revitalization religion, a religious and, ultimately, political response to European and Euro-American domination and ideology . . . [prophesying] a return to the precontact Indian way of life” (“Telling Dreams and Keeping Secrets: The Bole Maru as American Indian Religious Resistance,” *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 16:1 [1992])—figure in *Earth and Sky's* unifying sense of “blue archaeoastronomy?” By the same token, relations between different tribes might be detailed more specifically, where possible. A related problem, fortunately very minor herein, is the stubbornly tight link between salvage work and sheer data, which prompts the occasional echo that the main tragedy of white conquest and cultural disruption is the deprivation of data. Finally, there is the problem of clunky prose; a few of the book's pieces are noticeably much more awkward in writing style than the others. The pile-ups of declarative sentences and the suppression of transitions work against the book's thesis and spiritual center, its organic unity. But, on the plus side, this problem is not prevalent and is noticeable mainly because the clunkiness contrasts so sharply with the much more usual clarity and assurance and poetry that graces most of the essays.

An anthology of *Earth and Sky's* caliber should be expected to raise such questions and expectations. To raise expectations is to raise interest and testify that the material is stimulating, the research original, and the multivocalic ideal heartening. As the editors themselves remark, “Much remains to be done” (p. 21). But, in the doing, can we cross or recross the often monumental boundaries between such a participatory universe and a sky that all too often seems empty and cold? an earth disappearing from view? As Thomas McElwain writes in his discussion of Seneca hunting ceremonials, “The earth and sky have cooper-



ated in giving human beings the necessities of life" (p. 275). The rest—in all its beauty and radiating brilliance—is really up to us.

*Eric Anderson*

Rutgers–The State University of New Jersey

**Firesticks.** By Diane Glancy. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993. 142 pages. \$19.95 cloth.

The story of *Firesticks* is simple. A middle-aged woman with some Native American blood (one-fourth, from a grandmother) begins a relationship with a middle-aged man, whose one-eighth Indian heritage has been diluted beyond recognition. To his surprise and dismay, she gravitates increasingly toward this part of her background. Although she has maintained a close dependency on her personal, non-Indian space, the death of her father prompts her to move beyond these confines. As she travels with the man, first to arrange her father's burial and then, a bit later, to bury his pipe and belt buckle in the mountains where he had hoped to be laid to rest, her view of her own Indian past and of the Native American presence in the vast sweep of Oklahoma becomes dominant and informative, rather than just vaguely suggestive, as before.

This story is quite familiar in theme, as it should be: It is a contemporary Native American tale of discovery and coming to terms with a people's past and their own informed role in the present. In telling it, however, Diane Glancy has realized that a simple statement of the action is not enough. Stating what happens in discursive terms is gratifying, but the import of the story is anthropological and not literary—which is a shame, for her woman's experience is more aesthetic than simply social. Most crucially, to tell the story in conventional fictive form would miss the point, for the protagonist's visions and her experience in reckoning them are in themselves unconventional (by contemporary Anglo-American standards).

Therefore, in *Firesticks*, Diane Glancy has written not a novel, novella, or collection of short stories, but rather a work that incorporates elements of all three in order to produce much more. The closest comparison would be to a story cycle, itself a form only vaguely recalled in English language mainstream